



## Notice of a public meeting of

### Corporate Services, Climate Change and Scrutiny Management Committee

- To:** Councillors Fenton (Chair), Merrett (Vice-Chair), Ayre, B Burton, Coles, Crawshaw, Healey, Melly, Rose, Rowley, Waller, Widdowson and Whitcroft
- Date:** Monday, 7 October 2024
- Time:** 5.30 pm
- Venue:** West Offices - Station Rise, York YO1 6GA

### AGENDA

- 1. Declarations of Interest** (Pages 1 - 2)  
At this point in the meeting, Members and co-opted members are asked to declare any disclosable pecuniary interest, or other registerable interest, they might have in respect of business on this agenda, if they have not already done so in advance on the Register of Interests. The disclosure must include the nature of the interest.  
  
An interest must also be disclosed in the meeting when it becomes apparent to the member during the meeting.  
  
[Please see the attached sheet for further guidance for Members.]
- 2. Minutes** (Pages 3 - 6)  
To approve and sign the minutes of the meeting held on 9 September 2024.

### **3. Public Participation**

At this point in the meeting members of the public who have registered to speak can do so. Members of the public may speak on agenda items or on matters within the remit of the committee.

**Please note that our registration deadlines are set as 2 working days before the meeting, in order to facilitate the management of public participation at our meetings.** The deadline for registering at this meeting is **5:00pm on Thursday, 3 October 2024.**

To register to speak please visit [www.york.gov.uk/AttendCouncilMeetings](http://www.york.gov.uk/AttendCouncilMeetings) to fill in an online registration form. If you have any questions about the registration form or the meeting, please contact Democratic Services. Contact details can be found at the foot of this agenda.

### **Webcasting of Public Meetings**

Please note that, subject to available resources, this meeting will be webcast including any registered public speakers who have given their permission. The meeting can be viewed live and on demand at [www.york.gov.uk/webcasts](http://www.york.gov.uk/webcasts).

During coronavirus, we made some changes to how we ran council meetings, including facilitating remote participation by public speakers. See our updates ([www.york.gov.uk/COVIDDemocracy](http://www.york.gov.uk/COVIDDemocracy)) for more information on meetings and decisions.

### **4. Finance and Performance Monitor 1 2024/25** (Pages 7 - 18)

Members will consider a report which sets out the projected 2024/25 financial position and the performance position for the period covering 1 April 2024 to 30 June 2024. The report also includes the outturns for 2023/24.

### **5. Budget Setting Process** (Pages 19 - 24)

Members will receive a report on the Council's budget setting process which includes an update on some current financial challenges.

**6. Review of the Scrutiny Function** (Pages 25 - 30)

Members will consider a report on the scrutiny function which provides further information on the review of scrutiny procedures and structures at the council.

**7. Work Plan** (Pages 31 - 32)

To consider the scrutiny overview work plan.

**8. Urgent Business**

Any other business which the Chair considers urgent under the Local Government Act 1972.

Democracy Officer:

Jane Meller

Contact details:

- Telephone: (01904 555209)
- Email: [jane.meller@york.gov.uk](mailto:jane.meller@york.gov.uk)

For more information about any of the following please contact the Democratic Services Officer responsible for servicing this meeting:

- Registering to speak
- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports and
- For receiving reports in other formats

Contact details are set out above.

## Alternative formats

To request reasonable adjustments or to provide this document in an alternative language or format such as large print, braille, audio, Easy Read or BSL, you can:



Email us at: [cycaccessteam@york.gov.uk](mailto:cycaccessteam@york.gov.uk)



Call us: **01904 551550** and customer services will pass your request onto the Access Team.



Use our BSL Video Relay Service:  
[www.york.gov.uk/BSLInterpretingService](http://www.york.gov.uk/BSLInterpretingService)



Select 'Switchboard' from the menu.



**We can also translate into the following languages:**

我們也用您們的語言提供這個信息 (Cantonese)

এই তথ্য আপনার নিজের ভাষায় দেয়া যেতে পারে। (Bengali)

Ta informacja może być dostarczona w twoim własnym języku. (Polish)

Bu bilgiyi kendi dilinizde almanız mümkündür. (Turkish)

یہ معلومات آپ کی اپنی زبان (بولی) میں بھی مہیا کی جاسکتی ہیں۔ (Urdu)

### Declarations of Interest – guidance for Members

- (1) Members must consider their interests, and act according to the following:

Type of Interest	You must
Disclosable Pecuniary Interests	Disclose the interest, not participate in the discussion or vote, and leave the meeting <u>unless</u> you have a dispensation.
Other Registrable Interests (Directly Related) <b>OR</b> Non-Registrable Interests (Directly Related)	Disclose the interest; speak on the item <u>only if</u> the public are also allowed to speak, but otherwise not participate in the discussion or vote, and leave the meeting <u>unless</u> you have a dispensation.
Other Registrable Interests (Affects) <b>OR</b> Non-Registrable Interests (Affects)	Disclose the interest; remain in the meeting, participate and vote <u>unless</u> the matter affects the financial interest or well-being: (a) to a greater extent than it affects the financial interest or well-being of a majority of inhabitants of the affected ward; and (b) a reasonable member of the public knowing all the facts would believe that it would affect your view of the wider public interest. In which case, speak on the item <u>only if</u> the public are also allowed to speak, but otherwise do not participate in the discussion or vote, and leave the meeting <u>unless</u> you have a dispensation.

- (2) Disclosable pecuniary interests relate to the Member concerned or their spouse/partner.
- (3) Members in arrears of Council Tax by more than two months must not vote in decisions on, or which might affect, budget calculations,

and must disclose at the meeting that this restriction applies to them. A failure to comply with these requirements is a criminal offence under section 106 of the Local Government Finance Act 1992.

City of York Council

Committee Minutes

---

Meeting	Corporate Services, Climate Change and Scrutiny Management Committee
Date	9 September 2024
Present	Councillors Fenton (Chair), Merrett (Vice-Chair), Ayre, B Burton, Coles, Crawshaw, Healey, Melly, Rose, Rowley, Waller and Widdowson
Apologies	Councillor Whitcroft
In attendance	Cllr P Kilbane, Executive Member, Economy and Culture
Officers present	Kathryn Daly, Head of City Development Regeneration Project Delivery Officer, Acomb Front Street

---

### **13. Declarations of Interest (5.33 pm)**

Members were asked to declare any disclosable pecuniary interest, or other registerable interest, they might have in respect of business on the agenda, if they have not already done so in advance on the Register of Interests.

In relation to item 4, Acomb Front Street, Phase 2 Update, both Cllr Coles and Cllr Waller noted, for transparency reasons, that they were the area's Ward Councillors.

### **14. Minutes (5.34 pm)**

Resolved: That the minutes of the last meeting held on 8 July 2024 were approved as a correct record.

### **15. Public Participation (5.34 pm)**

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

## **16. Acomb Front Street Phase 2 Update (5.34 pm)**

The Head of City Development and the Project Officer introduced the report on Phase 2 of the Acomb Front Street project and gave a presentation, contained in Agenda Supplement 1, updating the Committee with the latest information since publication of the report. During the presentation they took the opportunity to thank the community for their high level of engagement whilst noting the competing needs of the different resident groups.

Officers highlighted the plans for a brand identity; a logo for Acomb, developed by the Greater Acomb Community Forum, had received positive feedback on social media and at the Joint Ward Committee meeting, it would be used on green coloured signage to create a community identity and cohesion throughout the scheme.

A breakdown of the timescales, subject to the Executive Member Decision Session, and costs was shared, and officers emphasized the spending deadline of 31 March 2025.

Cllr Kilbane, the Executive Member for Economy and Culture, noted that the funding for the project came from the UK Shared Prosperity Fund (SPF). He thanked the officers and community groups involved for their hard work.

Members asked a range of questions covering accessibility, including the trial of the wheelchair tactile paving, the type and quantity of seating and the proposed block paving. They also asked about the plans for the bollards once removed, the ongoing maintenance of the area, the proposed mural, the funding, the privately owned pavements, and the planned signage.

In response to Members' questions, Officers reported that:

- They would look at the suitability of the granite blocks proposed for the top of the raised tables and share the criteria for the planned evaluation of the wheelchair tactile paving trial once finalised.
- Offers had been received from the community to help with the future maintenance of the planters and they would look to formalise these arrangements where possible.
- They would liaise with Highways on the re-use of the bollards and the potential for a future budgetary saving on their re-use.



- The need to maintain the level of community interest and to increase engagement with young people aged between 18-24 was acknowledged.
- Officers confirmed their intention to continue council engagement with businesses, to maintain ongoing communication on the use and maintenance of the privately owned shop frontages.

[6.35-6.38pm, Cllr Merrett left the meeting.]

Resolved: That the above actions be included in the report to the decision session of the Executive Member for Economy and Culture.

Reason: To ensure that Members' comments from the pre-decision scrutiny are taken into consideration by the Executive Member.

[7.18-7.26pm, the meeting adjourned for a comfort break.]

## **17. Review of the Scrutiny Function (7.26 pm)**

Members received a report outlining a possible review of the Scrutiny Function. The Chair asked Members to consider their preferred approach for a review, considering the financial implications.

Several different options were considered including commissioning an external review, making use of the training budget to develop a training programme and/or sharing best practice with and between other local authorities. Several Members commented on the lack of dedicated Scrutiny Officers as a barrier to improving the function.

Following discussion it was:

Resolved: That the Chair and Vice-Chair would meet with the Head of Democratic Governance to understand the plans for the workforce structure of Democratic Services, with a view to bringing a more detailed proposal back to the Committee.

Reason: To ensure that a review of the Scrutiny Function achieves the optimum outcome for the best value.

**18. Work Plan (8.02 pm)**

Members considered the Scrutiny work plan for the four scrutiny committees and the Committee's work plan for the municipal year.

Resolved: That the work plan be noted.

Reason: To ensure an overview of the scrutiny work programme.

Cllr S Fenton, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.31 pm and finished at 8.07 pm].



---

**Corporate Services, Climate Change and  
Scrutiny Management Scrutiny Committee**

**7 October 2024**

Report of the Chief Operating Officer and Chief Finance Officer

**2024/25 Finance and Performance Monitor 1**

**Summary**

1. This report sets out the projected 2024/25 financial position and the performance position for the period covering 1 April 2024 to 30 June 2024, together with an overview of any emerging issues. This is the first report of the financial year and assesses performance against budgets, including progress in delivering the Council's savings programme.
2. This report outlines the Council's challenging financial position with a forecast overspend for 2024/25 of £3.4m. This is a huge improvement on the £11.4m forecast overspend we have previously seen at this stage in the financial year and is a direct result of the significant work undertaken by officers across all parts of the Council to identify savings and mitigations.
3. However, there is still a forecast overspend and therefore, whilst it is incredibly positive that the position is much improved, there remains a great deal of work still to do. It remains clear that the Council cannot afford to keep spending at this level. The general reserve is £6.9m and, whilst we have other earmarked reserves that we could call on if required, continued overspending will quickly see the Council exhaust its reserves.
4. The existing cost control measures remain in place, and further action is needed to bring spending down to an affordable level, both within the current financial year and over the next 3 years, to safeguard the Council's financial resilience and stability. The impact that this work is having can be clearly seen in this latest forecast and the Council's track record of delivering savings, along with robust financial management, provides a sound platform to continue to be able to deal with future challenges.

5. If we continue to take action and make any difficult decisions now, this will ensure the future financial stability of the Council and that we can continue to provide services for our residents. It is vital that mitigations are delivered, and the forecast overspend is reduced.

## **Background**

### **Financial Summary and Mitigation Strategy**

6. The current forecast is that there will be an overspend of £3.4m. This is despite the additional budget allocated through the 2024/25 budget process and ongoing action being taken by managers across the Council to try and reduce expenditure. If the Council continues to spend at the current level, and no action is taken, then we will continue to overspend and will exhaust our reserves and any other available funding. The current level of expenditure is unaffordable and therefore we must continue the work started in the previous financial year to identify and take the necessary actions to reduce expenditure.
7. As outlined in reports to Executive throughout the previous financial year, we have continued to see recurring overspends across both Adult and Children's Social Care. However, the underspends and mitigations that have allowed us to balance the budget at year end have generally been one off. Whilst the use of reserves to fund an overspend is appropriate as a one-off measure, it does not remove the need to identify ongoing savings to ensure the overall position is balanced. The budget report considered by Executive in February 2024 also included an assessment of risks associated with the budget, which included the need to secure further savings and effectively manage cost pressures.
8. Members will be aware that the financial position of local government is a national challenge and that the pressures being seen across both Adult and Children's Social Care are not something that is unique to York. Many Councils are experiencing significant financial pressures and struggling to balance their budgets now, so it is vital that we continue the work started last year to reduce our expenditure down to a sustainable level both within the current financial year and over the medium term.
9. Given the scale of the financial challenge, and the expected impact on budgets in future years, it is vital that every effort is made to balance the overall position. It is recognised that this will require difficult decisions to be made to protect services for vulnerable residents.

10. Corporate control measures are in place, but it is unlikely they will deliver the scale of reduction needed within the year. Other savings proposals, including service reductions, may also be needed. Officers will continue to carefully monitor spend, identify further mitigation, and review reserves and other funding to make every effort to reduce this forecast position. However, it is possible that it will not be reduced to the point that the outturn will be within the approved budget. The Council has £6.9m of general reserves that would need to be called on if this were the case. As outlined in previous reports, any use of the general reserve would require additional savings to be made in the following year to replenish the reserve and ensure it remains at the recommended minimum level.
11. The delivery of savings plans continues to be a clear priority for all officers during the year. Corporate Directors and Directors will keep Executive Members informed of progress on a regular basis.

### Financial Analysis

12. The Council's net budget is £149m. Following on from previous years, the challenge of delivering savings continues with c£14m to be achieved to reach a balanced budget. Early forecasts indicate the Council is facing net financial pressures of £3.4m and an overview of this forecast, on a directorate by directorate basis, is outlined in Table 1 below. Last years outturn is shown at Table 2.

Service area	Net budget £'000	2024/25 Forecast Variation £'000
Children & Education	28,659	1,359
Adult Social Care & Integration	45,307	2,361
Transport, Environment & Planning	23,464	-547
Housing & Communities	6,614	792
Corporate & Central Services	44,724	-69
<b>Sub Total</b>	<b>148,768</b>	<b>3,896</b>
Contingency	500	-500
Target for further mitigation		
<b>Total including contingency</b>	<b>149,268</b>	<b>3,396</b>

Table 1: Finance overview Q1 2024/25

Service area	Net budget	2023/24 Net Q3 Forecast Variation	2023/24 Outturn
	£'000	£'000	£'000
Children & Education	32,701	3,690	2,609
Adult Social Care & Integration	50,093	4,712	6,051
Place	33,206	-1,040	-2,310
Customers & Communities, Public Health & Corporate Services	8,935	830	-89
Central budgets	17,189	-2,600	-2,600
<b>Sub Total</b>		<b>5,592</b>	<b>3,661</b>
Contingency	-500	-500	-500
Use of earmarked reserves		-4,250	-3,161
Target for further mitigation		842	
<b>Net total including contingency</b>	141,624	nil	nil

Table 2: Finance overview 2023/24

## Directorate Analysis

### Corporate & Central Services

13. The forecast outturn position for the remaining areas of the Council is a net underspend of £69k and the top table below summarises the latest forecasts by service area. A 2023/24 table has been provided to show outturns, but please note this was on the previous organisational structure.

	2024/25 Budget £'000	Forecast Outturn Variance £'000	Forecast Outturn Variance %
Director of Finance	3,654	0	0
CO HR & Support Services	11,271	-75	-0.7
Director of Governance	3,795	6	-0.2
City Development	710	0	0
Public Health	13	0	0
Other Corporate & Treasury Mgt	25,280	0	0
Contingency	500	-500	-100
<b>Total</b>	<b>45,224</b>	<b>-569</b>	<b>-1.3</b>


	2023/24 Budget £'000	Outturn Variance £'000	Outturn Variance %
Chief Finance Officer	3,185	-54	-1.7
HR and Corporate Management	-18,446	-336	-1.8
Customers & Communities	18,300	446	2.4
Governance	5,328	-145	-2.7
Public Health	568	0	0
<b>Total Corporate, Customers &amp; Communities</b>	<b>8,935</b>	<b>-89</b>	<b>0.9</b>
Other central budgets and treasury management	17,189	-2,600	-15.1

14. Within the corporate services directorates it is forecast at Monitor 1 that expenditure can be broadly contained within budgets.
15. Within the Director of Finance area there are forecast shortfalls in income within Property Services as areas of West Offices remain unlet. The service is working with a number of potential tenants to reduce this value and it is hoped that the building will be fully let for future years however there remains a shortfall of £600k for 2024/25.
16. It is envisioned that this overspend can be mitigated by additional income from DWP relating to unclaimed reimbursement of benefits regarding hostels. This is subject to audit and an updated position will be provided at Monitor 2.
17. There remains £500k set aside as a contingency and this is assumed to be used to offset other financial pressures across the council.

### **Performance – Service Delivery**



18. This performance report is based upon the city outcome and council delivery indicators included in the Performance Framework for the Council Plan (2023-2027) which was launched in September 2023. This report only includes indicators where new data has become available, with a number of indicators that support the Council plan being developed. Wider or historic strategic and operational performance information is published quarterly on the Council's open data platform; [www.yorkopendata.org.uk](http://www.yorkopendata.org.uk)
19. The Executive for the Council Plan (2023-2027) agreed a core set of indicators to help monitor the Council priorities and these provide the structure for performance updates in this report. Some indicators are not measured on a quarterly basis and the DoT (Direction of Travel) is calculated on the latest three results whether they are annual or quarterly.

20. A summary of the city outcome and council delivery indicators by council plan theme are shown in the paragraphs below along with the latest data for the core indicator set.

Housing: Increasing the supply of affordable housing (City)						
	Previous Data	Latest Data	DoT	Frequency	Benchmarks	Data Next Available
% of dwellings with energy rating in A-C band in the EPC Register - Snapshot	44.60% (2023/24)	45.10% (Q1 2024/25)	 Good	Monthly	Not available	Q2 2024/25 data available in November 2024
The DoT (Direction of Travel) is calculated on the latest three data points whether they are annual or quarterly. All historic data is available via the Open Data Platform						

21. **% of dwellings with energy rating in A-C band in the EPC register –**  
 An Energy Performance Certificate (EPC) gives a property an energy efficiency rating from A (most efficient) to G (least efficient) and is valid for 10 years. Apart from a few exemptions, a building must have an EPC assessment when constructed, sold or let. Whilst the EPC register does not hold data for every property, it can be viewed as an indication of the general efficiency of homes. The rating is based on how a property uses and loses energy for example through heating, lighting, insulation, windows, water and energy sources. Each area is given a score which is then used to determine the A-G rating. In 2023, the median energy efficiency rating for a dwelling in England was Band D and a rating of A-C is generally considered to be good energy performance.

22. The % of properties on the register for York with an EPC rating of A-C at the end of June was 45.1%. This measure has increased incrementally month on month since CYC began reporting on the information 16 months ago when 42% of properties were rated A-C. The largest changes continue to be in the middle categories with around 3% less properties rated D-E and around 2.5% more rated C. The median grade for York as at June was band D which follows the latest national benchmark. Data is based on the last recorded certificate for 60,218 properties on the register for York, some of which will have been last assessed more than ten years ago.

Sustainability: Cutting carbon, enhancing the environment for our future (City)						
	Previous Data	Latest Data	DoT	Frequency	Benchmarks	Data Next Available
The average of maximum annual mean Nitrogen Dioxide concentration recorded across three areas of technical breach (at points of relevant public exposure) - Calendar	44.1 (2022/23)	38.8 (2023/24)		Annual	Not available	2024/25 data available in April 2025
Carbon emissions across the city (tonnes of carbon dioxide equivalent) - (Calendar Year)	912 (2019)	816 (2020)	 Good	Annual	Not available	2021 data available in October 2024
The DoT (Direction of Travel) is calculated on the latest three data points whether they are annual or quarterly. All historic data is available via the Open Data Platform						



23. **Level of CO2 emissions across the city and from council buildings and operations** – Carbon emissions across the city have been reducing over recent years, from 936 kilotonnes of carbon dioxide equivalent in 2018, to 816 in 2020. Emissions from councils buildings and operations have also been reducing, from 3,658 tonnes of carbon dioxide equivalent in 2020-21 to 3,462 in 2022-23. Data for 2021 and 2023-24 will be available in October 2024.

How the Council will operate (Council)						
	Previous Data	Latest Data	DoT	Frequency	Benchmarks	Data Next Available
FOI & EIR - % Requests responded to In time - (YTD)	88.99% (2023/24)	97.64% (Q1 2024/25)	↑ Good	Monthly	Not available	Q2 2024/25 data available in October 2024
% of 4Cs Complaints responded to 'In Time'	85.54% (2023/24)	51.79% (Q1 2024/25)	↓ Bad	Monthly	Not available	Q2 2024/25 data available in October 2024
The % of the Talkabout panel reporting an 'excellent' experience when they last contacted the council about a service	8.56% (Q3 2023/24)	8.42% (Q1 2024/25)	→	Quarterly	Not available	Q3 2024/25 data available in January 2025
The % of the Talkabout panel reporting a 'good' experience when they last contacted the council about a service	27.35% (Q3 2023/24)	22.11% (Q1 2024/25)	→	Quarterly	Not available	Q3 2024/25 data available in January 2025
The % of the Talkabout panel reporting a 'satisfactory' experience when they last contacted the council about a service	27.07% (Q3 2023/24)	28.16% (Q1 2024/25)	→	Quarterly	Not available	Q3 2024/25 data available in January 2025
The % of the Talkabout panel reporting a 'poor' experience when they last contacted the council about a service	15.47% (Q3 2023/24)	17.37% (Q1 2024/25)	→	Quarterly	Not available	Q3 2024/25 data available in January 2025
Average Sickness Days per FTE - CYC (Excluding Schools) - (Rolling 12 Month)	11.34 (May 2023)	11.44 (May 2024)	→	Monthly	CIPD (Public Sector) 2022/23 10.6	Q1 2024/25 data available in September 2024
York Customer Centre average speed of answer	00:00:13 (Phone) (2023/24)	00:00:42 (Phone) (Q1 2024/25)	→	Monthly	Not available	Q2 2024/25 data available in October 2024

The DoT (Direction of Travel) is calculated on the latest three data points whether they are annual or quarterly.  
All historic data is available via the Open Data Platform

24. **FOI and EIR** – 98% of requests were responded to in-time during Q1 2024-25 which is the highest figure seen for a number of years.
25. **% of 4Cs complaints responded to in-time** – In 2023-24, there had been a large decrease in the number of corporate complaints received compared to 2022-23 (1,310 in 2023-24 compared to 1,866 in 2022-23). This decrease has continued into 2024-25 with 278 corporate complaints received in Q1 (compared to 479 in Q1 2023-24). However, there has been a large reduction in performance for the percentage of corporate complaints responded to in time (85.5% in 2023-24 but only 51.8% in Q1 2024-25).
26. **% of the Talkabout panel reporting an excellent, good, satisfactory or poor experience when they last contacted the council about a service**

– The results for this indicator show that the majority of the panel report having a ‘good’ (22%) or ‘satisfactory’ (28%) experience when they last contacted the Council, with 8% reporting an ‘excellent’ experience and 17% reporting a ‘poor’ experience.

27. **Average sickness days per full time equivalent (FTE) employee** – At the end of May 2024, the average number of sickness days per FTE (rolling 12 months) had increased slightly to 11.44 days from 11.34 in May. Recently released benchmarks show that the CIPD public sector benchmark is 10.6 days per FTE, putting us in line with national trends.
28. **York Customer Centre average speed of answer** – Phones were answered, on average, in 42 seconds during Q1 2024-25 by the York Customer Centre. This remains low, although is slightly higher than the average of 13 seconds during 2023-24.

### **Consultation**

29. Not applicable.

### **Options**

30. Not applicable.

### **Analysis**

31. Not applicable.

### **Council Plan**

32. Not applicable.

### **Implications**

33. The recommendations in the report potentially have implications across several areas. However, at this stage
- **Financial implications** are contained throughout the main body of the report. The actions and recommendations contained in this report should ensure the continued financial stability and resilience of the Council both in the current year and in future years.
  - **Human Resources (HR)**, there are no direct implications related to the recommendations.

- **Legal** The Council is under a statutory obligation to set a balanced budget on an annual basis. Under the Local Government Act 2003 it is required to monitor its budget during the financial year and take remedial action to address overspending and/or shortfalls of income.
- **Procurement**, there are no specific procurement implications to this report.
- **Health and Wellbeing**, there are no direct implications related to the recommendations.
- **Environment and Climate action**, there are no direct implications related to the recommendations.
- **Affordability**, there are no direct implications related to the recommendations.
- **Equalities and Human Rights**, there are no direct implications related to the recommendations.
- **Data Protection and Privacy**, there are no implications related to the recommendations.
- **Communications**, there are no direct implications related to the recommendations.
- **Economy**, there are no direct implications related to the recommendations.

### **Risk Management**

34. An assessment of risks is completed as part of the annual budget setting exercise. These risks are managed effectively through regular reporting and corrective action being taken where necessary and appropriate.
35. The current financial position represents a significant risk to the Council's financial viability and therefore to ongoing service delivery. It is important to ensure that the mitigations and decisions outlined in this paper are delivered and that the overspend is reduced.

### **Recommendations**

36. The Committee is asked to:
  - a. Note the finance and performance information.
  - b. Note that work will continue on identifying savings needed to fully mitigate the forecast overspend.

Reason: to ensure expenditure is kept within the approved budget.

**Contact Details**

**Author:**

Debbie Mitchell  
Chief Finance Officer  
Ext 4161

Ian Cunningham  
Head of Business  
Intelligence  
Ext 5749

**Chief Officer Responsible for the report:**

**Ian Floyd**  
**Chief Operating Officer**

**Report**  **Date**  
**Approved**

Ian Floyd  
Chief Operating Officer

**Report**  **Date** 25/09/24  
**Approved**

**Wards Affected:** *List wards or tick box to indicate all* **All**

**For further information please contact the author of the report**

**Background Papers:** None.

**Annexes:** CSCCSM Q1 24-25 Scrutiny Committee Scorecard



# Scrutiny - Corporate Services and Climate Change 2024/2025

No of Indicators = 23 | Direction of Travel (DoT) shows the trend of how an indicator is performing against its Polarity over time.  
Produced by the Business Intelligence Hub September 2024

			Previous Years			2024/2025							
		Collection Frequency	2021/2022	2022/2023	2023/2024	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Target	Polarity	DOT	
01. Business	BPI110	Forecast Budget Outturn (£000s Overspent / - Underspent) - CYC Subtotal (excluding contingency)	Quarterly	£2,638	£4,887	£3,661	£3,896	-	-	-	-	Up is Bad	◄ Neutral
	BUR01	Business Rates - Rateable Value	Monthly	£255,734,051	£252,801,976	£242,602,745	£242,054,821	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral
02. Customer Service	CFS01	Overall Customer Centre Satisfaction (%) - CYC	Monthly	93.48%	72.10%	84.40%	83.60%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	◄ Neutral
	OCC06B	Number of days taken to process Housing Benefit new claims and change events (DWP measure)	Monthly	3.19	3.72	4.16	6.27	-	-	-	-	Up is Bad	▲ Red
		Benchmark - National Data	Quarterly	6.05	6.32	(Avail Oct 2024)	-	-	-	-	-		
	YCC030a	Footfall in Customer Centre - Average wait time (Minutes)	Monthly	12	9	9	2	-	-	-	-	Up is Bad	▼ Green
YCC057	YCC Average Speed of answer - Operators	Weekly	00:01:28	00:01:42	00:00:13	00:00:42	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral	
03. Human Resources	OCC09	CYC stand-alone apprenticeships (excluding schools) - (Snapshot)	Quarterly	24	24	21	18	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	▼ Red
	STF08	Staff FTE - CYC Total (Including Schools) - (Snapshot)	Monthly	2,680.09	2,736.35	2,744.74	2,738.08	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral
	STF100	Average Sickness Days per FTE - CYC (Excluding Schools) - (Rolling 12 Month)	Monthly	11.73	11.96	11.2	-	-	-	-	-	Up is Bad	◄ Neutral
		Benchmark - CIPD (Public Sector)	Annual	NA	10.6	-	-	-	-	-	-		
STF107	Voluntary Turnover (%) - CYC Total (Including Schools) - (Rolling 12 Month)	Monthly	10.45%	11.38%	8.33%	8.70%	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral	
04. Risk Management	CORP02L a	Red rated Large Projects - CYC - (Snapshot)	Quarterly	0	0	2	2	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral
	CORP02L b	Amber rated Large Projects - CYC - (Snapshot)	Quarterly	11	11	8	7	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral
	CORP10L	Large Project - Carbon Reduction	Quarterly	-	-	-	Green	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral
		Large Project - HR System Transfer to Cloud	Quarterly	-	-	-	Green	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral
		Large Project - Green Waste	Quarterly	-	-	-	Green	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral
		Large Project - Mansion House	Quarterly	-	-	-	Green	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral
Large Project - Retrofit One Stop Shop York (ROSSY)	Quarterly	-	-	-	Green	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄ Neutral		
05. Finance	BPI110	Forecast Budget Outturn (£000s Overspent / - Underspent) - CYC Subtotal (excluding contingency)	Quarterly	£2,638	£4,887	£3,661	£3,896	-	-	-	-	Up is Bad	◄ Neutral
	TAP02	% of panel satisfied with the way the council runs things	Quarterly	50.58%	47.30%	43.84%	41.47%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	▼ Red
		Benchmark - LG Inform	Quarterly	63.00%	62.00%	-	-	-	-	-			

			Previous Years			2024/2025							
			2021/2022	2022/2023	2023/2024	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Target	Polarity	DOT	
06. Resident Surveys	TAP37	% of the panel reporting an 'excellent' experience when they last contacted the council about a service	Quarterly	-	-	8.56%	8.42%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	◄► Neutral
		% of the panel reporting a 'good' experience when they last contacted the council about a service	Quarterly	-	-	27.35%	22.11%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	◄► Neutral
		% of the panel reporting a 'satisfactory' experience when they last contacted the council about a service	Quarterly	-	-	27.07%	28.16%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	◄► Neutral
		% of the panel reporting a 'poor' experience when they last contacted the council about a service	Quarterly	-	-	15.47%	17.37%	-	-	-	-	Up is Bad	◄► Neutral
07. Sustainability	CAN038	The average of maximum annual mean Nitrogen Dioxide concentration recorded across three areas of technical breach (at points of relevant public exposure) (ug/m3) (Calendar Year)	Annual	43.8	44.1	38.8	-	-	-	-	-	Up is Bad	◄► Neutral
	EPC01ac	% of dwellings with energy rating in A-C band in the EPC Register (where A is the most energy efficient and G is the least energy efficient) - (Snapshot)	Monthly	NC	42.00%	44.60%	45.10%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	▲ Green
	GCC02	Carbon emissions across the city (kilotonnes of carbon dioxide equivalent) (Calendar Year)	Annual	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	Up is Bad	◄► Neutral
08. Information Governance	FOI01	FOI & EIR - Total Requests Received	Monthly	1,685	1,291	1,640	427	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄► Neutral
	FOI02	FOI & EIR - % Requests responded to In time - (YTD)	Quarterly	81.20%	85.50%	88.99%	97.64%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	▲ Green
		FOI & EIR - % Requests responded to In time	Monthly	81.05%	85.48%	88.99%	97.03%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	▲ Green
	FOI05	DP (Data Protection Act) / SAR (Subject Access Request) - Total Received - (YTD)	Monthly	117	132	175	48	-	-	-	-	Neutral	◄► Neutral
		DP (Data Protection Act) / SAR (Subject Access Request) - % In time - (YTD)	Quarterly	72.10%	64.39%	72.00%	45.83%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	◄► Neutral
	IG14da	% of 4Cs Complaints responded to 'In Time'	Monthly	84.15%	94.56%	85.54%	51.79%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	▼ Red
IG22a	% of Grade 1 4Cs Complaints responded to 'In Time'	Monthly	80.71%	86.15%	66.32%	48.25%	-	-	-	-	Up is Good	▼ Red	



---

**Corporate Services, Climate Change and Scrutiny Management Committee****7 October 2024**

Report of the Director of Finance

**Budget Setting Process****Summary**

1. This report outlines the Council's approach to budget setting and provides an update on some of the current financial challenges. Members are asked to note that a further report will be presented to the November meeting of this Committee that will include further details of the 2025/26 budget proposals.

**Background**

2. The financial pressures facing the Council are significant and have been ongoing for several years. This Council is one of the 20 lowest funded Councils in the country, with the result that we spend much less on services than many other areas.
3. Over the next few years, the Council will see some of the most significant financial challenges we have ever experienced. The delivery of current and future years budgets will be extremely challenging for residents, partners, members, and officers. It is important that we do not underestimate the scale of the challenge ahead. The level of savings required will inevitably require reductions in service levels and may result in some services stopping completely. Robust financial management, clear priorities and a focus on cost control are all essential to ensuring our continued financial sustainability and resilience.

**Consultation**

4. Starting back in May 2024, the council is undertaking a comprehensive budget consultation due to conclude in December 2024, prior to more formal public participation in Executive in January 2025 and Council in February 2025.
5. By following a staged approach, the council is iteratively building an understanding of both the impact of proposals on different demographics

and community groups, together with how partners, businesses and residents can work together to deliver our shared ambitions for the city.

6. The stages the budget consultation is following is below, with the first two phases completed and the third due to start later in October:

<sup>1</sup> What	When	Purpose	Consultation activities
Stage 1 - Corporate Improvement Framework	May to June 2024	To understand how to be a more efficient and effective organisation, informing the Corporate Improvement Action Plan and Working as One City transformation programme Feedback is published on the Opendata platform: <a href="#">Corporate Improvement Framework Consultation 2024/25 - Datasets - York Open Data</a>	Resident online and offline consultation Workshops with Trade Unions, staff and partners who participated in the LGA Peer Challenge
Stage 2 - Our Big Budget Conversation - ideas	July to September 2024	To understand more about what York residents and businesses believe should be the council's priorities and where they would like to see cuts or reductions in services, with all the feedback independently assessed and published on the OpenData platform	Resident and business online/offline consultations Independently facilitated workshops with residents, community groups and businesses Workshops with partners Staff ideas hub
Stage 3 - Our Big Budget Conversation - budget proposals	October to December 2024	To understand the impact and considerations of the proposed cuts or reductions in service	Resident and business online/offline consultation
Stage 4 - Budget approval	January - February 2025.	Public participation in democratic decision making	Executive Full Council

7. It is proposed that a further report is presented to this committee in November, when budget proposals will have been presented for consultation as outlined in the table above.

### **2024/25 Finance Update**

8. A separate report elsewhere on this agenda considers the current years financial position, which although a significant improvement on the forecast last year at this time, still shows a forecast overspend of c£4m.

<sup>1</sup> [Our Big Budget Conversation – City of York Council](#)



9. Cost control measures are still in place to ensure spend is minimised and savings are made wherever possible.

### **Annual Budget Setting Process**

10. The following paragraphs outline the annual budget setting process in terms of the legislative requirements, decision making and outline timetable.
11. Every council must have a balanced and robust budget for the forthcoming financial year and also a Medium-Term Financial Strategy (MTFS) which projects forward likely income and expenditure over the next 3 years. Due to income constraints and the pressure on service expenditure through increased demand and inflation, projected expenditure is usually higher than projected income.
12. Whilst such budget gaps are common in years two and three of the MTFS, the requirement to approve a balanced and robust budget for the immediate forthcoming year means that efforts need to be made to ensure that any budget gap in the next financial year is closed. This is achieved by making proposals to reduce expenditure and/or increase income. Clearly all stakeholders will be concerned with any potential effect that these financial decisions have on service delivery.
13. The annual budget report outlines the proposals that will be taken forward and includes an overarching Equalities Impact Assessment that attempts to look at the cumulative impact of the budget. A number of the individual proposals will also require their own assessments and consultation with service users which will be undertaken separately at the appropriate time.
14. There is a significant amount of legislation around local authority financial planning and budgeting.
15. The Local Government Act 2000 states that it is the responsibility of the full council, on the recommendation of the Executive, to approve the budget and related council tax demand.
16. The Local Government Act 2003, section 25 requires the council's Section 151 officer to report to the council on the robustness of the estimates made and the adequacy of the proposed financial reserves assumed in the budget calculations.
17. The Local Government Finance Act 1988, section 114 requires the Section 151 officer to report to all of the authority's councillors if there is

or is likely to be unlawful expenditure or an unbalanced budget. The council must meet within 21 days to consider the report and during that period the authority is prohibited from entering into new arrangements that will cause money to be spent.

18. Failure to set a legal budget may lead to intervention from the Secretary of State under section 15 of the Local Government Act 1999.
19. The following paragraphs outline the annual budget setting process.

#### April to July

Estimate revenue income and expenditure over at the next 3 years, updating for previous years outturn position and any other information available.

#### July to September

Identify any new budget pressures.

Calculate forecast budget gap (difference between forecast expenditure and forecast income).

Chief Officers and Heads of Service start detailed work to identify new efficiencies and savings proposals.

Consider any capital projects needed.

Begin discussions with Executive Members as to the level and type of savings required.

#### October to December

Budget consultation with residents, partners and community groups, including reports to scrutiny.

Finalise budget proposals with the Executive, including potential impacts and risks.

Review budget in light of Local Government Provisional Settlement and update budget assumptions for any Government announcements.

#### January

Revenue and capital budgets considered by Executive.

#### February

Revenue and capital budgets debated at Full Council. Council Tax is set.

### **Council Plan**

20. The Medium Term Financial Strategy aims to ensure that, as far as possible, resources are aligned to the Council's priorities.

### **Recommendations**

21. Members are asked to consider note the information in this report and agree to receive a further report in November.

Reason: To keep the Committee informed of any financial issues.

### **Contact Details**

#### **Author and Chief Officer responsible for the report:**

Debbie Mitchell  
Director of Finance  
01904 554161

**Report**                    ✓    **Date**    23/09/2024  
**Approved**

**Wards Affected:** List wards or tick box to indicate all                    **All**    ✓

**For further information please contact the author of the report**

### **Background Papers:**

Medium Term Financial Strategy Update Executive 12 September 2024

### **Annexes**

None

### **Abbreviations**

LGA Local Government Association  
MTFS Medium Term Financial Strategy

This page is intentionally left blank



---

## Corporate Services Climate Change and Scrutiny Management Committee

7 October 2024

Report of the Director of Governance  
Leader, Portfolio Holder for Policy, Strategy and Partnerships

### Review of the Scrutiny Function

#### Summary

1. This report seeks to provide members with further information regarding the proposal received from the Centre for Governance and Scrutiny, and first reported to the Committee on 9 September 2024, in respect of a review of the scrutiny procedures and structures of City of York Council.
2. Following the February 2024 Local Government Association (LGA) Peer Challenge of the City of York Council, the subsequent report presented to the Council's Executive in May 2024 stated:  
"Scrutiny arrangements at CYC would benefit from review. As a function of governance, it can be hugely beneficial for quality of decision-making if it is fully supported and empowered to be a positive and integral part of policy development. It is clear that this is recognised by the administration as an area where a fresh look at how improvements can be made would also be a good use of time and effort."
3. The council has prepared a draft Corporate Improvement Action Plan in response to the Peer Challenge report, which includes a commitment to undertake work to strengthen and review scrutiny oversight.

#### Background

4. Overview and scrutiny committees were established in English and Welsh local authorities by the Local Government Act 2000. They were intended as a counterweight to the new executive structures created by that Act. Their role was to develop and review policy and make

recommendations to the council. Relevant councils must have at least one overview and scrutiny committee.

5. The legislative provisions for overview and scrutiny committees for England are set out in Section 9F of the Act as amended by Localism Act 2011. These state:
  - Executive arrangements by a local authority must ensure that its overview and scrutiny committee has power (or its overview and scrutiny committees, and any joint overview and scrutiny committees, have power between them)—
  - to review or scrutinise decisions made, or other action taken, in connection with the discharge of any functions which are the responsibility of the executive,
  - to make reports or recommendations to the authority or the executive with respect to the discharge of any functions which are the responsibility of the executive,
  - to review or scrutinise decisions made, or other action taken, in connection with the discharge of any functions which are not the responsibility of the executive,
  - to make reports or recommendations to the authority or the executive with respect to the discharge of any functions which are not the responsibility of the executive,
  - to make reports or recommendations to the authority or the executive on matters which affect the authority's area or the inhabitants of that area.
6. Overview and scrutiny committees must have the power to 'call in' decisions made by their executives but not yet implemented. The statutory minimum requirement is that "call in" enables the scrutiny committee to recommend that the decision be reconsidered by the person who made it.
7. Local authorities also have limited powers of 'external scrutiny', where their committees look at issues which lie outside the council's responsibilities, with specific powers to scrutinise health bodies,

community safety partnerships, and Police and Crime Commissioners.

8. The City of York council Scrutiny structure consists of four Scrutiny Committees, each of which has 10 scheduled meetings each year:
  - Corporate Services, Climate Change and Scrutiny Management Committee
  - Children, Culture and Communities Scrutiny Committee
  - Economy, Place, Access and Transport Scrutiny Committee
  - Health, Housing and Adult Social Care Scrutiny Committee
9. The Corporate Services, Climate Change and Scrutiny Management Committee acts as the overarching committee, meeting separately as a “calling in” committee to consider call in requests.

### **The CfGS Review Proposal**

10. As reported to the previous meeting of the Committee, the Centre for Governance and Scrutiny (CfGS) proposes to conduct a Scrutiny Impact Review for CYC, which will include the following:
  - Review of current arrangements around operating culture, behaviours, relationships, and mindset
  - Evaluation of organisational commitment and clarity of purpose
  - Observation of member and officer skills and capacity
  - Investigation of the current impact of the scrutiny process
  - Production of a report based on the findings
  - Provision of actionable recommendations to enhance scrutiny arrangements, ensuring they are robust, impactful, and contribute to better governance outcomes
  - Evaluation and enhancement the effectiveness of scrutiny
  - Application of best practices along with statutory and non-statutory guidance, to ensure scrutiny processes are effective and aligned with national standards
11. The indicative cost of the review is £17,000. The LGA has confirmed that it will fund £7,000 of that cost, leaving CYC to fund the balance of £10,000.
12. There is currently an annual budgetary provision of £5,000 for external research and consultancy work to support the scrutiny function. There has been no spend in this current financial year against this budget. In previous

years, some of the budget has been used to fund training for scrutiny members.

13. The funding offer from the LGA presents an opportunity to have an in-depth review, delivered by external experts working in conjunction with member, for a relatively small cost. The budgetary provision has been made, specifically, to fund a CfGS external review.
14. Officers are due to meet representatives of the CfGS on 7 October and the outcome of that will be reported verbally to the Committee.

### **Implications**

15. **Financial** The estimated cost of the review is £17,000. The Centre for Governance and Scrutiny has confirmed that £7,000 of the cost of undertaking the review will be met by the LGA, leaving the remaining cost of £10,000 to be funded by CYC. Given the importance of this work, which will strengthen the council's scrutiny function and thereby enhance its democratic function as required by the Corporate Improvement Plan, funding will be identified from within existing budgets.
16. **Human Resources (HR)** None arising.
17. **Legal** The Council has a statutory duty to operate a scrutiny function.
18. **Equalities and Human Rights** None directly arising from the report. Any review of the scrutiny function will fully address these issues.
19. **Reputational** Failing to review the way in which Scrutiny operates at CYC, and the structures and resources that support Scrutiny, may have a detrimental effect, both internally and externally, on the reputation of the authority in terms of the effectiveness of the Scrutiny function.

### **Proposal**

20. The report is presented for information, however, the views of Committee members are invited so that they may help to shape the review work.



## Contact Details

### Author:

Lindsay Tomlinson  
Head of Democratic Governance  
[Lindsay.tomlinson@york.gov.uk](mailto:Lindsay.tomlinson@york.gov.uk)

### Chief Officer Responsible for the report:

Bryn Roberts  
Director of Governance

Report  
Approved



Date 26/09/24

### Wards Affected:

All

For further information please contact the author of the report

### Background Papers:

LGA Peer Review Report: [LGA Corporate Peer Challenge Final Report \(york.gov.uk\)](#)

Corporate Improvement Framework: [Annex B DRAFT IMPROVEMENT FRAMEWORK FINAL FOR CONSULTATION.pdf \(york.gov.uk\)](#)

Statutory Guidance, Overview & Scrutiny:

<https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/overview-and-scrutiny-statutory-guidance-for-councils-combined-authorities-and-combined-county-authorities/overview-and-scrutiny-statutory-guidance-for-councils-combined-authorities-and-combined-county-authorities>

This page is intentionally left blank

## Scrutiny Work Plan

Meeting Date	Committee	Agenda Item
07/10/24	CSMC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Finance &amp; Performance Outturn 2023/24 and Monitor Q1</li> <li>• Budget Setting Process</li> <li>• Scrutiny Review</li> </ul>
01/10/24	CCC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Finance &amp; Performance Q1 (for information)</li> <li>• School Attendance</li> <li>• Early Years and Childcare Reforms</li> <li>• Virtual School Annual Report</li> </ul>
09/10/24	HHASC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Finance and Performance Outturn Report and Monitor 1</li> <li>• ADASS Peer Review of ASC</li> <li>• ASC Strategy update</li> </ul>
22/10/24	EPAT	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• (Q1) Finance and Performance Monitoring Report</li> <li>• City centre access: reviewing the implementation / restoration of access for blue badge holders; including data on the numbers/types of vehicles accessing during foot street hours. Plus looking at faults with HVB.</li> </ul>
05/11/24	CCC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Free School Meal Pilot Year Review</li> <li>• York Explore Annual Update</li> <li>• Digital Inclusion Update</li> <li>• Locality Model</li> </ul>
06/11/24	HASC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Urgent care delivery review in York and the East Coast</li> <li>• Health Needs Assessment for people with Autism and ADHD; to include update on the production of the Autism and Neurodivergence Strategy</li> <li>• Lasting effects of the pandemic and review for winter 2024/25</li> </ul>
11/11/24	CSMC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Complaints and Compliments, Annual Report</li> <li>• Workforce Strategy</li> <li>• Budget Proposals</li> <li>• Council Motions and Schedule of Petitions</li> </ul>

The Forward Plan can be found [here](#).

## **Scrutiny Work Plan**

### Committees

CSMC	Corporate Services, Climate Change and Scrutiny Management Committee
EPAT	Economy, Place, Access and Transport Scrutiny Committee
HHASC	Health, Housing and Adult Social Care Scrutiny Committee
CCC	Children, Culture and Communities Scrutiny Committee